

Resolution No.

STOCKTON CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD

RESOLUTION RECOMMENDING THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR ISSUE A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE PROPOSED REHABILITATION OF A STRUCTURE IN THE MAGNOLIA HISTORIC DISTRICT AT 345 EAST ACACIA STREET (APPLICATION NO. P18-0782)

The applicant and home owner, David Wellenbrock, submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness application for the proposed replacement of four (4) windows at the street-facing façade of an existing residence at 345 East Acacia Street, located in the Magnolia Historic District; and

A Certificate of Appropriateness is required in accordance with Stockton Municipal Code section 16.220.060(A)(1) since the proposed replacement of windows constitutes an alteration to a structure within a historic preservation district; and

The subject home was constructed in 1937 and appears to be of the Moderne or Streamline Moderne style popular in the 1920's-1940's. This style was characterized by horizontal orientation, rounded edges/corner windows, flat roofs, smooth stucco surfaces, and the use of glass block; now, therefore,

BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CULTURAL HERITAGE BOARD OF THE CITY OF STOCKTON, AS FOLLOWS:

A. The foregoing recitals are true and correct and incorporated by this reference.

B. Based on its review of the entire record herein, the Cultural Heritage Board makes the following findings in italics:

Certificate of Appropriateness Findings

The issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness would:

1. Designate, enhance, preserve, protect, restore, and perpetuate those historic districts, neighborhoods, sites, structures, and zones, which contribute to the aesthetic and cultural benefit of the City.

Finding: As proposed, the application would result in windows inconsistent with the architectural style of the subject home. Therefore, replacement with period appropriate windows is necessary to prevent the degradation of the home individually and district incrementally.

2. Encourage public appreciation, knowledge, and understanding of, and a sense of

identity with, the City's past.

Finding: The rehabilitation of the structure through the installation of period appropriate windows would encourage appreciation of the home's history and its place within the Magnolia Historic District.

3. Foster civic and neighborhood pride in the accomplishments and beauty of the past.

Finding: See Finding #2 above.

4. Stabilize and improve the economic value of historic districts, neighborhoods, sites, structures, and zones.

Finding: The investment in the rehabilitation of the subject property's façade through the installation of period appropriate windows would stabilize and improve the value of the structure which would be carried over to the Magnolia Historic Preservation District as a whole.

5. Help preserve the diverse architectural design and styles that reflect phases of the City's history and encourage complementary design and construction.

Finding: Through the installation of period appropriate windows, the application would retain an element relevant to the architectural style conveyed by the structure, reflecting the city's past and the historic district in which it is a part of.

6. Promote and encourage continued private ownership and utilization of structures currently owned and used.

Finding: The rehabilitation will encourage utilization of the structure and continued private ownership.

Secretary of Interior's Standards

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

As the application is limited to window replacement, the historic purpose of the structure as a single-family dwelling would not change.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Materials that characterize the subject home were removed without prior approval. Replacement windows consistent with the home's architectural style is possible with commercially available products. As such, consistency under this standard

would, under staff's recommendation, require compliance with a condition of approval requiring the installation of windows appropriate to the architectural style.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

The project excludes alterations with the potential to result in false historicism.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

The application does not concern a change which may have required historic significance. Based on available Google Street View imagery, the windows replaced were consistent with the home's architectural style.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.

See response to Standard #2 above.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

See response to Standard #2 above.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

No chemical or physical treatment is proposed.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

The application involves to earthwork. Therefore, this standard is not applicable.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

See response to Standard #2 above.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

No new adjacent construction is proposed.

Cultural Heritage Board Action

Based on its review of the entire record herein, including the February 6, 2019, Cultural Heritage Board staff report, all supporting, referenced, and incorporated documents, and all comments received, the Cultural Heritage Board recommends the Community Development Director issue a Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the following conditions of approval:

Standard Conditions of Approval

1. This approval recommendation authorizes the replacement of four (4) windows at the portion of the building elevation shown in Exhibit 1. However, the windows presently in those location, installed without the benefit of permits, shall be replaced with windows which are true-divided or simulated-divided (if exterior mullions present), in a grid-pattern consistent with other like windows remaining on the home, subject to the approval of the Director.
2. As provided at Stockton Municipal Code section 16.220.060(I)(2), this approval shall be valid for twelve (12) months.
3. The Owner, Developer, and/or Successor in Interest (ODS) shall comply with all applicable Federal, State, County, and City codes, regulations, and adopted standards and pay all applicable fees.
4. Compliance with these conditions of approval is mandatory. Failure to comply with these Conditions of Approval is unlawful, constitutes a public nuisance, and is subject to the remedies and penalties identified in the Stockton Municipal Code, including but not limited to monetary fines and revocation or modification of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

//
//
//
//
//
//
//
//

5. Changes to this shall be processed in compliance with Stockton Municipal Code Chapter 16.104 (Changes to an Approved Project).

PASSED, APPROVED, and ADOPTED February 6, 2019.

WESLEY SWANSON, Chair
Stockton Cultural Heritage Board

ATTEST:

STEPHANIE OCASIO, Secretary
Stockton Cultural Heritage Board