



---

CITY OF STOCKTON

---

HUMAN RESOURCES DEPARTMENT

400 E. Main Street, Third Floor • Stockton, CA 95202

Phone: 209 / 937-8233 • Fax 209 / 937-8558 • [www.stocktonca.gov](http://www.stocktonca.gov)

February 8, 2024

TO: CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

FROM: ROSEMARY RIVAS, DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

**SUBJECT: RESPONSE TO REQUEST FOR CORRECTION IN COMPUTING  
EXAMINATION SCORES – PROGRAM MANAGER I ELIGIBILITY LIST**

On November 28, 2023, City of Stockton employees Julie Dycus-Coons and Lynn Smith submitted a Request for Appeal/Public Hearing (Exhibits A and B) regarding the results of a practical exam administered by the Human Resources (HR) Department and scored on November 6, 2023. The practical exam was administered to establish an eligibility list for the job classification of Program Manager I. In the requests, Ms. Dycus-Coons and Ms. Smith cited Civil Service Rules for Miscellaneous Employees, Rule VI Application and Examination, Section 10(d) Errors in Computing Scores, as the basis for their appeal. Rule VI, Section 10(d) reads as follows:

*“(d) Errors in Computing Scores. Upon the request of a candidate, the candidate shall be granted a consultation with the director and/or the Chief Examiner to discuss the correction of any item or errors in the computation of the candidate’s total score, and to review the reasons for the score. The consultation may include discussion of the written, performance, oral, or other rating devices.*

*If an error in the marking or grading of an examination is raised by the candidate, the Civil Service Commission shall be informed at the next regular meeting. The Commission shall consider the request from the candidate and the report from the director concerning such alleged error(s). The Commission shall determine the need for correction and, if necessary, shall instruct the director to republish the eligible list as corrected by the Commission. Such correction(s) shall not invalidate any certification or employment previously made.”*

The following are issues brought forward by Ms. Dycus-Coons and Ms. Smith regarding the “exam material” along with HR’s response:

1. **Statement:** Missing instructions.

Response to Request for Correction in Computing Examination Scores – Program Manager I  
Eligibility List  
February 8, 2024  
Page 2 of 3

**Response:** Ms. Dycus-Coons and Ms. Smith failed to outline what instructions they believed were missing from the Project Manager I examination (Exhibit C). The same examination and instructions were provided to all candidates. The remaining 24 candidates brought up no concerns with the instructions of the exam.

2. **Statement:** Errors in Exercise #1.

**Response:** Exercise #1 required candidates to prioritize items A through G. Although there was a total of seven (7) items, candidates were asked to complete a table for six (6) items. A space for the 7<sup>th</sup> priority was inadvertently not included. Out of the 26 candidates, 23 of them included a 7<sup>th</sup> priority in their answers. One (1) of the three (3) that did not list a 7<sup>th</sup> priority did not pass the entire exam. However, missing the 7<sup>th</sup> priority was not a determining factor in their failing.

3. **Statement:** No guidance on labeling submittals using Person ID # instead of name.

**Response:** Exercise #2 required candidates to write a sample memorandum using a provided scenario. A template was also provided to help guide candidates with how to format the memorandum. Candidates were graded on the content and ability to write clear, organized, and concise memos. Whether an employee used a name or Person ID# in the memorandum was not used for scoring purposes.

Conclusion

The examination was proctored and assessed by qualified individuals who were equal to or above the level for which was tested and were appropriately trained in the testing process. The examination process was applied fairly to all competitors.

Ms. Dycus-Coons and Ms. Smith request “corrections of any errors in the computation of my total score.” However, HR concludes that there are no errors to correct, and it is not necessary to republish the established eligibility list for the Program Manager I. We recommend that the Civil Service Commission maintain the existing eligibility list established December 21, 2023.



ROSEMARY RIVAS  
DIRECTOR OF HUMAN RESOURCES

RR:jp

Attachments:

Exhibit A – J. Dycus-Coons Request for Appeal/Public Hearing

Response to Request for Correction in Computing Examination Scores – Program Manager I  
Eligibility List  
February 8, 2024  
Page 3 of 3

Exhibit B – L. Smith Request for Appeal/Public Hearing  
Exhibit C – Project Manager I Examination

CITY OF STOCKTON CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
REQUEST FOR APPEAL/PUBLIC HEARING

ATTACHMENT B

NAME: Julie Dycus-Coons DATE: 11/28/2023  
JOB TITLE: Office Specialist DEPARTMENT: MUD

hereby appeals to the City of Stockton Civil Service Commission pursuant to the Civil Service Rules and Regulations for (check one):

☐ Police and Fire Employees OR ☒ Miscellaneous Employees

Please state in a concise manner the nature of the appeal including the disciplinary action taken, the result being sought through the appeal (e.g., reinstatement, rescission of suspension, etc.), and the civil service rule upon which the appeal is based:

I believe there were inaccuracies in the calculation of the candidates' relative standings in the Project Manager I practical exam, and I request a review and clarification on my standing on the eligible list, as per Civil Service Rule SEC. 10(d). I am requesting correction of any errors in the computation of my total score. The harm suffered is the denial of a fair opportunity based on unclear evaluation criteria and procedural discrepancies.

Please state in a concise manner the issues to be decided by the Commission:

I am requesting a thorough review and clarification of the evaluation process, as outlined in Civil Service Rule SEC. 10. Certain grounds warrant reconsidering the results of the Project Manager I practical exam, and request your attention to rectify any errors. Exam material issues: Missing instructions, errors in Exercise #1, no guidance on labeling submittals using Person ID# instead of name. I am requesting assurance of a fair opportunity based on clear evaluation criteria and procedural consistency.

**NOTE:** Hearings for appeals of disciplinary or employment actions will be scheduled **no sooner than thirty (30) days** from the Commission's approval of the request, unless you mark the appropriate space below, indicating your intent to waive said requirement.

For **disciplinary and employment actions**, it has been the practice of the Civil Service Commission to deliberate in a **closed session** following the public hearing. The authority for closed sessions is set forth in **Government Code section 54957**. In accordance with that section, **YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED** that the Commission shall follow its established past practice unless you notify the Commission prior to or during the time of your hearing that deliberation in open session is preferred.

I hereby (check one) ☒ **waive** or ☐ **do not waive** the requirement under Civil Service Rule XIIA, section 4 (Police and Fire)/Rule XIV, section 4 (Miscellaneous) that the hearing occur **no sooner than thirty days** from the date of my request.

Appellant's Signature: \_\_\_\_\_ Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Address: \_\_\_\_\_

**TO ASSIST THE COMMISSION IN REVIEWING YOUR APPEAL, PLEASE PROVIDE EIGHT (8) COPIES OF ANY AND ALL DOCUMENTS SUBMITTED.**



CITY OF STOCKTON CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION  
REQUEST FOR APPEAL/PUBLIC HEARING

NAME: Lynn Smith DATE: 11/28/2023  
 JOB TITLE: Office Specialist DEPARTMENT: MUD

hereby appeals to the City of Stockton Civil Service Commission pursuant to the Civil Service Rules and Regulations for (check one):

☐ Police and Fire Employees **OR** ☒ Miscellaneous Employees

Please state in a concise manner the nature of the appeal including the disciplinary action taken, the result being sought through the appeal (e.g., reinstatement, rescission of suspension, etc.), and the civil service rule upon which the appeal is based:

I believe there may have been inaccuracies in the calculation of the candidates' relative standings in the Project Manager I practical exam, and I request clarification on my standing on the eligible list, as per Civil Service Rule SEC. 10(d). I am requesting correction of any errors in the computation of my total score. The harm suffered is the potential denial of a fair opportunity based on unclear evaluation criteria and procedural discrepancies.

Please state in a concise manner the issues to be decided by the Commission:

I am requesting a thorough review and clarification of the evaluation process, as outlined in Civil Service Rule SEC. 10. Certain grounds warrant reconsidering the results of the Project Manager I practical exam, and request your attention to rectify any errors. Exam material issues: Missing instructions, errors in Exercise #1, no guidance on labeling submittals using Person ID# instead of name. I am requesting assurance of a fair opportunity based on clear evaluation criteria and procedural consistency.

**NOTE:** Hearings for appeals of disciplinary or employment actions will be scheduled **no sooner than thirty (30) days** from the Commission's approval of the request, unless you mark the appropriate space below, indicating your intent to waive said requirement.

For **disciplinary and employment actions**, it has been the practice of the Civil Service Commission to deliberate in a **closed session** following the public hearing. The authority for closed sessions is set forth in **Government Code section 54957**. In accordance with that section, **YOU ARE HEREBY NOTIFIED** that the Commission shall follow its established past practice unless you notify the Commission prior to or during the time of your hearing that deliberation in open session is preferred.

I hereby (check one) ☒ **waive** or ☐ **do not waive** the requirement under Civil Service Rule XIIA, section 4 (Police and Fire)/Rule XIV, section 4 (Miscellaneous) that the hearing occur **no sooner than thirty days** from the date of my request.

Appellant's Signature: Lynn Smith Date: 11/28/2023

Address: lynn.smith@stocktonca.gov

**TO ASSIST THE COMMISSION IN REVIEWING YOUR APPEAL, PLEASE PROVIDE EIGHT (8) COPIES OF ANY AND ALL DOCUMENTS SUBMITTED.**



**PROJECT MANAGER I  
Civil Service Examination  
September 28, 2023**

**Exercise #1**

You will be scored on your ability to prioritize important tasks and duties that affect the role of Project Manager I daily.

**Assignment:**

Your assignment is to read each item and prioritize the items in order of importance. After prioritizing the items, list your responses in the table provided.

Then you will provide a brief, typed statement for each item describing your methodology for prioritizing the task and what factors you took into consideration. You may make assumptions as necessary and provide your responses on this document.

**Exercise #1- Prioritization:**

It is 9:00 a.m. on Monday, October 9, 2023.

- A. You have three (3) new voicemails and fifteen (15) new emails unanswered.
- B. You are scheduled to present a project status update to your supervisor and colleagues at the weekly division staff meeting scheduled for Thursday, October 12, 2023, at 10:00 a.m. and you still have some finishing touches to make on your presentation.
- C. You are managing a Drive-Thru Recycling event on Saturday, October 14, 2023. You need to prepare for the event by ensuring you have staff scheduled for the event and promotional items prepared to distribute.
- D. A mandatory grant expenditure report is due to be electronically submitted to the Department of Resources Recycling and Recovery (CalRecycle) by 2:00 p.m. on Wednesday, October 18. The report is 50% complete.
- E. Last Friday, the Community Services Department sent you a special event recycling plan for review and approval. The Department goal for plan review and approval is two days. The event is scheduled for Saturday, November 4, 2023.
- F. Prepare a staff report for departmental routing and Council approval to request the purchase and installation of new public waste collection containers. Council Date - March 26, 2024. Note: Items must be in the routing approval process a minimum of six weeks before the Council Date.
- G. You are scheduled to attend a 1-hour safety meeting today which starts at 1:30 p.m.

(continued on next page)

Priority	Letter
#1	
#2	
#3	
#4	
#5	
#6	

Provide your methodology for prioritizing each task and the factors you took for consideration.

**Exercise #2 - Writing:**

In Exercise #2 you will be scored on your ability to communicate in writing with clear and concise thoughts, your competency in spelling, grammar, sentence structure, and other aspects of basic written communication.

**Assignment**

As the newly appointed Project Manager I To better organize and streamline department workflow, your supervisor has tasked you with researching and recommending an SB 1383 Compliance Tracking Software. The system must be cloud-based, have a user-friendly platform for field and office use, and be able to maintain records and produce compliance reports. You have been given a deadline of three months to provide your final analysis and recommendation; however, your supervisor has requested a project outline in one week.

Write a memo to your supervisor explaining your methodology for completing the assignment; specifically, what steps you will take and what factors should be taken into consideration. Include a timeline of project tasks and deadlines.

While some basic information has been provided, you may make assumptions as necessary and include any additional information you deem necessary. Visuals such as charts, graphs, and tables may be used in your report. A sample memo format has been provided. Remember to adhere to the formatting guidelines listed on the instruction sheet.



SAMPLE - Exercise #2: Writing

Person ID# 1234567

**MEMORANDUM**

DATE:

TO: Jason Miller, Program Manager III

FROM: Name, Project Manager I

SUBJECT: **SB 1383 COMPLIANCE TRACKING SOFTWARE**

Type the body of the memo here.